

**RACHEL ROBINSON** 

President

**BRETT CALLAHAN** 

President-Elect

**ALISON MULLINS** 

Secretary

**LU ALOUPAS** 

Treasurer

MARGARET HARDY

Immediate Past President

**Board of Directors** 

STACIE BORDICK

**TIFFANY BURTON** 

MAUREEN CARR

JANET CHO

JANLI CITO

**ANGELA DIAZ** 

SHEMEKA HANKINS

KAY HEIDBREDER

**CLAIRE KEENA** 

ANNE C. LAHREN

**DARREL TILLAR MASON** 

JOAN MCKENNA

MICHELLE R. PARKER

NANCY REYNOLDS

ELIZABETH ROSS

JAMEL ROWE

CORRIE SIRKIN
SARAH SCHMIDT

BETSY SUE SCOTT

LISA SHEA

**ZAIDA THOMPSON** 

JOHNEAL WHITE

#### **CLAIRE BAKER**

Administrative Director

POST OFFICE BOX 3806 MERRIFIELD, VIRGINIA 22116-3806

PHONE: 804-282-6363 www.VWAA.org

E-Mail: VWAA@live.com

March 18, 2022

Via First Class Mail and Email Hon. John S. Edwards, Senator c/o Shannon Heard Pocahontas Bldg. Room E506 Senate of Virginia P.O. Box 396 Richmond, VA 23218 sheard@dls.virginia.gov

Hon. R. Creigh Deeds, Senator Pocahontas Building, Room E503 Senate of Virginia P. O. Box 396 Richmond, VA 23218 district25@senate.virginia.gov

Hon. Robert B. Bell, Delegate Pocahontas Bldg. Room E606 House of Delgates Richmond, VA 23218 DelRBell@house.virginia.gov

Re: Vacancy on the Supreme Court of Virginia

Dear Senator Edwards, Senator Deeds, and Delegate Bell:

On behalf of the Virginia Women Attorneys Association ("VWAA"), a judiciary committee (the "Committee") was impaneled to evaluate candidates for a vacancy on the Supreme Court of Virginia created by the retirement of the Hon. William C. Mims.

The VWAA requested that interested candidates complete the VWAA Judicial Candidates Questionnaire (the "Application"), submit a short biography, and participate in an interview with the Committee. Prior to the interviews, members of the Committee contacted references on each candidate's Application and other members of the local bar and legal community to inquire as to each candidate's suitability for the vacancy. The Committee interviewed seventeen (17) candidates *via* Zoom or Teams. An additional eleven (11) candidates who participated in the application process for the Virginia Court of Appeals and/or prior Supreme Court of Virginia vacancies were given the opportunity to maintain their prior VWAA rating and opted to do so.

The VWAA ratings are based upon a review of each candidate's merits against published standards and guidelines, including: fairness, integrity, experience, intellect, temperment, professionalism, and pro bono service. Ratings are not a function of a general vote by the VWAA membership, nor are they a comparison of candidates within the "pool" presented.

The following rating categories are used by the VWAA:

- (1) NOT QUALIFIED: Applied to any applicant who fails to meet the minimum requirements for fairness, experience, intellect, temperament, professionalism, integrity and/or other basic criteria set forth in the ABA Guidelines for Reviewing Qualifications for Judicial Office ("ABA Guidelines").
- (2) QUALIFIED: Applied to any applicant who meets the minimum requirements for fairness, experience, intellect, temperament, professionalism, integrity and/or other basic criteria set forth in the ABA Guidelines.
- (3) RECOMMENDED: Applied to any applicant whose qualifications are sufficiently above the minimum requirements to warrant the Committee's affirmative recommendation.
- (4) HIGHLY RECOMMENDED: Reserved for any candidate who is especially well-qualified for the position and merits special recommendation.

The VWAA's procedures provide that ratings of "Qualified" and "Recommended" require a vote in support by at least a simple majority of the Committee. A rating of "Highly Recommended" requires a vote in support by at least a two-thirds majority of those voting. In order for the Committee to find that a candidate fails to meet the minimum qualifications and is "Not Qualified," at least two-thirds of those voting must so find.

The Executive Committee of the Board of Directors of the VWAA has approved, under its procedures, the following endorsements of the Committee for this judicial vacancy:

Hon. Clifford L. Athey, Jr. is found Highly Recommended

Hon. David Bernhard is found *Highly Recommended\** 

Hon. Randolph A. Beales is found Highly Recommended

Jennifer Franklin, Esq., is found *Highly Recommended\** 

Hon. Frank K. Friedman is found Highly Recommended\*

Hon. Richard E. Gardiner is found *Highly Recommended\** 

Hon. Glen A. Huff is found Highly Recommended

Hon. David W. Lannetti is found *Highly Recommended\** 

K. Lorraine (Lori) Lord, Esq. is found Highly Recommended\*

Hon. Mary B. Malveaux is found Highly Recommended

Hon. Stacey W. Moreau is found *Highly Recommended\** 

Patricia P. Rene (nee Nagel), Esq., is found Highly Recommended\*

Hon. Stuart A. Raphael is found *Highly Recommended\** 

Hon. Wesley G. Russell, Jr. is found Highly Recommended

Hon. Kimberley White is found Highly Recommended

Hon. Victoria A.B. Willis is found *Highly Recommended\** 

Brian L. Buniva, Esq. is found *Recommended*Hon. David B. Carson is found *Recommended*Hon. J. Christopher Clemens is found *Recommended*Hon. Douglas L. Fleming, Jr. is found *Recommended*Michael Hernandez, Esq. is found *Recommended*Robert W. Loftin, Esq. is found *Recommended*Hon. Thomas P. Mann is found *Recommended*Catherine French Zagurskie, Esq. is found *Recommended*\*

Andrew S. Baugher, Esq. is found *Qualified* Tillman J. Breckenridge, Esq. is found *Qualified* Gregory S. Duncan, Esq. is found *Qualified* 

Walter G. Sharp, Sr. is found Not Qualified

Executive summaries of the qualifications of each of the above candidates are attached to this letter.

\* Candidates denoted with an asterisk were previously reviewed and rated by a VWAA review committee within the last 18 months. Under the VWAA Judiciary Committee Rules, these candidates elected to rely on their prior ratings and attested in writing that there have been no material changes in the veracity of the information previously submitted.

For your further information, the Committee members participating in the interview process were:

**Maureen Carr, Co-Chair:** Ms. Carr is a partner with the law firm of Bean, Kinney & Korman, PC. She focuses her practice on employment law and commercial litigation. She has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 2006, a member of the Board of Directors of the Northern Virginia Chapter of the VWAA since 2015 (past-President of the Northern Virginia Chapter), and a member of the State Board of Directors of the VWAA since 2018.

**Michelle Parker, Co-Chair:** Ms. Parker is an associate attorney with Decker, Cardon, Thomas, Weintraub & Neskis in Norfolk. She primarily practices in the areas of personal injury, civil litigation, wills, trusts and estates, and probate. She has been a member of the Virginia State Bar and admitted to practice in all courts of the Commonwealth of Virginia and the U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of Virginia since 2004. She is a member and past president of the VWAA and continues to serve on the Board of Directors of VWAA. She is a member and serves on the Executive Committee of The James Kent American Inn of Court.

Anne C. Lahren: Ms. Lahren is Of Counsel at Pender & Coward, P.C. in Virginia Beach, practicing civil litigation, immigration, employment, and family law. Ms. Lahren is admitted to practice before the United States Supreme Court, the Supreme Court of Virginia, the United States Court of Appeals for the 4th Circuit, the U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of Virginia, the U.S. Bankruptcy Court for the Eastern District of Virginia, and the Executive Office for Immigration Review.

**Pia J. Miller:** Ms. Miller is a Deputy Commonwealth's Attorney in the Office of the Commonwealth's Attorney for Fairfax County. Prior to becoming a prosecutor, Ms. Miller was in private practice handling family law matters along with indigent criminal defense, and also served as

a public defender. Before entering private practice, she served as a law clerk for the Honorable Richard B. Potter at the Prince William County Circuit Court. She has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 2008, and the Maryland State Bar since 2007.

**Laurie Forbes Neff:** Ms. Neff is a Partner and the head of the Family Law Section of The Geller Law Group PLLC. She focuses her practice in the area of domestic relations, including divorce, child custody and visitation, child support, spousal support, and equitable distribution. Previously, she was a professor of law at the George Mason School of Law, where she ran the Mason Veteran & Servicemembers Legal Clinic. Ms. Neff has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 2001.

**Bradlee K. Suggs:** Ms. Suggs is an Assistant Commonwealth's Attorney in the City of Staunton, Virginia and a former law clerk to the Honorable William H. Seals, Jr. in South Carolina. Ms. Suggs is licensed to practice law in Virginia, North Carolina, and South Carolina.

We hope this information will prove helpful to you during your review process for this very important judicial position. Please contact us if you have questions or need additional information.

Cordially yours,

/s/ Rachel Robinson/s/ Maureen Carr/s/ Michelle R. ParkerRachel RobinsonMaureen CarrMichelle R. Parker

President, VWAA Co-Chair, Judiciary Committee Co-Chair, Judiciary Committee

Enclosures: Executive Summary of the Hon. Clifford L. Athey, Jr.

Executive Summary of Andrew S. Baugher, Esq.

Executive Summary of the Hon. Randolph A. Beales

Executive Summary of the Hon. David Bernhard\*

Executive Summary of Tillman J. Breckenridge, Esq.

Executive Summary of Brian L. Buniva, Esq.

Executive Summary of the Hon. David B. Carson

Executive Summary of the Hon. J. Christopher Clemens

Executive Summary of Gregory S. Duncan, Esq.

Executive Summary of the Hon. Douglas L. Fleming, Jr.

Executive Summary of Jennifer Franklin, Esq.\*

Executive Summary of Hon. Frank K. Friedman, Esq.\*

Executive Summary of the Hon. Richard E. Gardiner\*

Executive Summary of Michael Hernandez, Esq.

Executive Summary of the Hon. Glen A. Huff

Executive Summary of the Hon. David W. Lannetti\*

Executive Summary of Robert W. Loftin, Esq.

Executive Summary of K. Lorraine (Lori) Lord, Esq.\*

Executive Summary of the Hon. Mary B. Malveaux

Executive Summary of the Hon. Thomas P. Mann

Executive Summary of the Hon. Stacey W. Moreau\*

Executive Summary of the Hon. Stuart A. Raphael\*

Executive Summary of Patricia P. Rene (nee Nagel), Esq.\*

Executive Summary of Wesley G. Russell, Jr.

Executive Summary of Walter G. Sharp, Sr.
Executive Summary of the Hon. Kimberley White
Executive Summary of the Hon. Victoria A.B. Willis\*
Executive Summary of Catherine French Zagurskie, Esq.\*

cc (via email only): Hon. Clifford L. Athey, Jr.

Andrew S. Baugher, Esq.

Hon. Randolph A. Beales

Hon. David Bernhard

Tillman J. Breckenridge, Esq.

Brian L. Buniva, Esq.

Hon. David B. Carson

Hon. J. Christopher Clemens

Gregory S. Duncan, Esq.

Hon. Douglas L. Fleming, Jr.

Jennifer Franklin, Esq.

Hon. Frank K. Friedman, Esq.

Hon. Richard E. Gardiner

Michael Hernandez, Esq.

Hon. Glen A. Huff

Hon. David W. Lannetti

Robert W. Loftin, Esq.

K. Lorraine (Lori) Lord, Esq.

Hon. Mary B. Malveaux

Hon. Thomas P. Mann

Hon. Stacey W. Moreau

Hon. Stuart A. Raphael

Hon. Wesley G. Russell, Jr.

Patricia P. Rene (nee Nagel), Esq.

Walter G. Sharp, Sr.

Hon. Kimberley White

Hon. Victoria A.B. Willis

Catherine French Zagurskie, Esq.

## THE HONORABLE CLIFFORD L. ATHEY, JR.

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Athey earned his bachelor's degree from Virginia Commonwealth University in 1990 and his Juris Doctor from the University of Dayton Law School in 1993. Judge Athey has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1994.

Judge Athey began his practice of law in Front Royal, Virginia, as an associate attorney with Edward F. Greco, P.C. Thereafter, he and three other attorneys established the firm of Napier, Pond, Athey & Athey, which later became Pond, Athey, Athey & Pond, PC. His practice consisted of mostly civil law matters including personal injury, civil litigation, land use and some bankruptcy, and some court appointed work. Judge Athey was appointed to the 26<sup>th</sup> Judicial Circuit bench in 2012 and served as Chief Judge from 2016 to 2017. In 2019, he was appointed to the Court of Appeals of Virginia in 2019, where he remains to date.

Judge Athey served on the Judicial Council of Virginia for four years, during which he served on the committee tasked by the Virginia Supreme Court to develop and implement judicial evaluations. Since joining the Virginia Court of Appeals, Judge Athey has served on the facilities committee for the Court of Appeals, where he assisted in the planning and development of a new Supreme Court of Virginia and a new Court of Appeals of Virginia.

Judge Athey served Front Royal as a Council Member from 1996 to 2000, as Mayor of Front Royal from 2000 to 2002, and as a Delegate in the Virginia General Assembly from 2002 to 2012.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Judge Athey demonstrated his dedication to public service and a commitment to equality in the law. Judge Athey demonstrated that he possesses and exceeds the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Judge Athey demonstrated a sincere commitment to ensuring that the legal professional maintains professionalism, integrity and civility. The Committee finds that Judge Athey possesses and exceeds the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge Athey's professionalism, integrity and commitment to public service make him an excellent candidate for the Supreme Court of Virginia. The Committee finds that Judge Athey is very well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

## **ANDREW S. BAUGHER**

Experience and Legal Ability: Mr. Baugher earned his bachelor's degree from James Madison University and his Juris Doctor from the Regent University School of Law where he was chairman of the Moot Court Board and received honors including placing in First Place twice and receiving Best Brief in Moot Court competition. He has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 2007.

After being admitted to practice law in Virginia, Mr. Baugher served as a Law Clerk for the Office of Chief Staff Attorney at the Supreme Court of Virginia. Following this clerkship, Mr. Baugher entered private practice and became a Shareholder of Flora Pettit PC in 2014, where he has been a member of the firm's Board of Directors since 2019 and has served as President of the firm since 2020.

Mr. Baugher's practice is evenly divided between the state and federal courts and focuses on business-oriented litigation, including representing business owners and employers in employment discrimination, wage-and-hour, restrictive covenant, and related claims, along with intellectual property, business tort, and ownership disputes (e.g., derivative, dissolution, and similar claims). In recent years, his practice representing construction companies in contract, payment, bond, and mechanic's lien cases, has increased. He is admitted to practice in the U.S. District Courts for the Eastern and Western Districts of Virginia, the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Fourth Circuit, the Supreme Court of Virginia, the U.S. Bankruptcy Court of the Western District of Virginia, and the U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of Michigan.

Mr. Baugher is heavily involved in professional and civic service. He serves on the VBA Civil Litigation Section Council (since 2019), previously served on the VBA Committee on Nominations to Virginia Commissions and Appellate Courts in 2014 and 2018, served as President of the Harrisonburg-Rockingham Bar Association in 2017-2018, serves as a Board Member the American Subcontractors Association of Shenandoah Valley, and served for eight years as a Board Member of Big Brothers Big Sisters of Harrisonburg & Rockingham County from 2013 to 2021.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Mr. Andrew Baugher demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: The Committee finds that Mr. Andrew Baugher possesses the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Mr. Baugher's professionalism, demeanor, and depth of knowledge meet the requirements for the Supreme Court of Virginia. Accordingly, the Committee finds that he is qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **QUALIFIED**.

## THE HONORABLE RANDOLPH A. BEALES

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Beales earned his bachelor's degree from the College of William and Mary in 1982 and his Juris Doctor from the University of Virginia in 1986. Judge Beales has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1986.

Judge Beales began his legal career in the corporate/business section of Williams, Mullen, Christian and Dobbins. He then joined the Office of General Counsel for the United States Department of Education in 1987, which led him to a position in the White House as Deputy Associate Director of Policy Development. He briefly returned to private practice in 1993, joining Peterson & Basha, PC handling their estate and trust matters. From 1995 to 1998, Judge Beales served as the Executive Director of the Virginia Business-Education Partnership within the Secretary of Education's office. He continued his work in the education arena as the Executive Director of the Governor's Commission on Champion Schools from 1995 to 1996. In 1998, he was appointed as the Chief Deputy Attorney General, later becoming the Attorney General of Virginia in 2001. In 2002, Judge Beales again returned to private practice with Christian & Barton, LLP, where he served as a partner until his appointment to the Court of Appeals of Virginia in 2006. He has served as member of the Court of Appeals of Virginia for nearly 16 years.

During his legal career, Judge Beales has remained committed to public service and bettering the Commonwealth of Virginia. He has held numerous appointments, including service on the Attorney General's Task Force on Child Abuse and the Attorney General's Task Force on Oxycontin and Prescription Drug Abuse. Judge Beales has also served on numerous boards, including as Vice Chairman of the Center for Rural Virginia Board of Trustees and as a Trustee for the College of William and Mary Endowment Association.

Judge Beales loves being an appellate judge, finding it intellectually stimulating while finding joy in acting within the rule of law each day. He is committed to writing opinions that are useful to lawyers and non-lawyers alike. He is further committed to encouraging *pro bono* service and collegiality among members of the bar, while also remaining committed to mentoring newer attorneys and children of the local community to encourage them to enter the legal profession.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Judge Beales demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: The Committee finds that Judge Beales possesses the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge Beales is well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia. He warrants the Committee's rating of **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

#### THE HONORABLE DAVID BERNHARD

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Bernhard earned a Bachelor of Arts in Economics and Political Science, graduating a year early from Brandeis University in 1983; and a Juris Doctor from Washington University in St. Louis School of Law in 1985, which he completed a half-year early. He was admitted to the Virginia State Bar in 1988.

From 1987 to 1989, Judge Bernhard was an associate attorney practicing mainly immigration law. In 1989 he started his own firm in Arlington where he handled a variety of criminal, family law, and personal injury matters in addition to serving as a Guardian ad Litem. From 1991 to 2017, he was a partner at Bernhard & Gardiner, focusing on criminal, divorce, and appellate practice. As an attorney, Judge Bernhard handled tens of thousands of cases and hundreds of jury trials. He became a proficient trial and appellate attorney with excellent research and writing skills and had numerous noteworthy cases. Additionally, he has been published twice in the Fairfax Bar Journal (2011, 2012), and in the Washington Post (2014). He won the Fairfax Bar Association President's Award (2011) and was recognized by Virginia Lawyer's Weekly as a Leader in the Law (2012).

He was an active member of the Fairfax Bar Association, holding positions such as Co-Chair of the Criminal Law Practice Section (2011-2014), member of the Judicial Screening Committee (2012-2014, Chair 2013); and the Hispanic Bar Association, where he served as a screener on the Judicial Selection Committee (2006-2014). Additionally, he and his law partner developed the VADefenses Listserv Group, which has become the second largest criminal listserv in Virginia and a valuable networking tool among practitioners.

In February 2017, Judge Bernhard was appointed to the 19th Judicial Circuit (Fairfax), taking the bench on July 1, 2017. Judge Bernhard has a reputation as "the fact checker," and as a judge who will take time to do the research needed to make a fair decision. His letter opinions are considered the product of diligent effort and thoughtful consideration of the law as applied to the specific facts of the case and written with a sincere desire to provide guidance for attorneys.

Judge Bernhard's community involvement includes being the longest serving Board member of the Forest Hills of Fairfax Homeowners Association, where he last served as its President and was active in establishing the governance of the Association, organizing volunteer projects, and environmentally restoring the civil war-era pond.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Throughout his submission and interview and with additional information gathered during the screening process, Judge Bernhard consistently displays his dedication to public service and a passion to make "equal justice under law" a reality rather than an unattainable ideal. He is known for treating everyone with fairness and respect. Judge Bernhard demonstrated that he possesses and exceeds the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Judge Bernhard is held in high esteem in his courthouse and in the community. The Committee finds that he possesses and exceeds the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge Bernhard is very well-qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

## TILLMAN BRECKENRIDGE

Experience and Legal Ability: Tillman Breckenridge earned his bachelor's degree from the University of Virginia in 1998 and his Juris Doctor from the University of Virginia School of Law in 2001. He was admitted to the Virginia State Bar in 2012 after being previously admitted to practice law in Illinois, California, and the District of Columbia.

Mr. Breckenridge has worked in the litigation and/or appellate groups for a multitude of firms throughout the United States: Sidley Austin Brown & Wood in Chicago, Illinois and Los Angeles, California (2001-2005); Greines Martin Stein & Richland, LLP in Los Angeles, California (2005-2007); Fulbright & Jaworski, LLP in Washington, DC (2007-2011); Reed Smith LLP in Washington, DC and Richmond, Virginia (2011-2015); Bailey & Glasser LLP (2015-2018); and Pierce Bainbridge Beck Price & Hecht, LLP in Washington, DC (2018-2020). From 2012 to 2020, Mr. Breckenridge was a St. George Tucker Adjunct Professor of Law at William and Mary School of Law, where is also founded and was the Director of the Appellate and Supreme Court Clinic. Since 2020, Mr. Breckenridge has been a principal at Breckenridge PLLC in Washington, DC, focusing on appellate work.

Mr. Breckenridge has significant appellate experience, having represented clients before the United States Supreme Court, every federal court of appeals, and several state appellate courts. He also provides appellate trial consulting services and speaks on appellate and related topics.

Mr. Breckenridge has received numerous awards, including being recognized by Virginia's Legal Elite; Washington, D.C. SuperLawyers; Savoy Magazine – Most Influential Black Lawyers in America; National Bar Association 40 Under 40; Just the Beginning Foundation 20 Under 40; and ACLU of Southern California – Criminal Justice Award.

Mr. Breckenridge has been actively involved in the American Academy of Appellate Lawyers (Current Chair of Drew Days Committee on Diversity in Appellate Practice); National Bar Association (Past Chair of Appellate Section, Past Board of Governors); National Foundation for Judicial Excellence (Current Board of Directors and Executive Committee); Edward Coke Appellate Inn of Court (Former Secretary); Federation of Defense and Corporate Counsel (Current Chair of Appellate Committee); and DRI (Past Chair of Appellate Committee).

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Throughout his submission and interview, Mr. Breckenridge demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: The Committee finds that Mr. Breckenridge possesses the requisite professionalism and Integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Mr. Breckenridge is well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **QUALIFIED**.

## BRIAN L. BUNIVA

Experience and Legal Ability: Mr. Buniva earned his bachelor's degree from Georgetown University in 1972 and his Juris Doctor from the University of Richmond, T. C. Williams School of Law in 1979. Mr. Buniva has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1979.

Mr. Buniva began his practice as an Assistant Attorney General handling matters involving environmental and administrative agencies until 1982, when he took a position as an associate attorney with McSweeney, Burtch & Crump, P.C. where his practice focused on environmental, land use, administrative and labor law. In 1987 he opened a general civil and criminal law practice. In 1989, he focused his practice primarily on environmental law. He was a shareholder/director and Chair of the Environmental and Litigation Sections at Kelly, Lewis & Buniva from 1989 to 1990 and also handled criminal and traffic defense and domestic relations cases: shareholder/director and Chair of the Environmental Section at McCandlish Kaine (now McCandlish Holton) from 1990 to 2001; and Vice-President/shareholder/director and Chair of Environmental Section at LeClair Ryan from 2001 to 2010. Thereafter, Mr. Buniva joined Eckert, Seamans, Cherin & Mellott, LLC as a member of the Environmental and Litigation Sections until 2011, when he pivoted to Sequa Corporation as Senior Counsel and Senior Director of Environment, Health and Safety until 2017. In 2017, Mr. Buniva opened B. L. Buniva Strategic Advisor, PLLC where is continues as Owner/Managing Member. In his current practice he utilizes the skills he has honed over his career for development and implementation of strategic initiatives regarding land use development, working with governmental agencies, environmental law, corporate governance and as a neutral dispute resolution advisor.

Mr. Buniva served as the 82<sup>nd</sup> President of the Virginia State Bar (2020-2021). Over the last five years, the majority of Mr. Buniva's practice has been civil litigation in state courts or before state/governmental agencies and focused on non-jury trials/hearings regarding land use development, working with governmental agencies, environmental law, and corporate governance.

Mr. Buniva is active with the Midlothian Friends Meeting of the Religious Society of Friends a/k/a Quakers, the Old Dominion Bar Association and volunteers for pro bono publico work with CVLAS and VLAS.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Mr. Buniva demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: The Committee finds that Mr. Buniva possesses the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Mr. Buniva's professionalism, demeanor, and depth of knowledge would make him a valuable addition to the Supreme Court of Virginia. The Committee finds that he is well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **RECOMMENDED**.

## THE HONORABLE DAVID BRADFORD CARSON

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Carson earned his bachelor's degree from Dartmouth College in 1985 and his Juris Doctor from the Washington and Lee University School of Law in 1988, where he was honored as a Burks Scholar Teaching Fellow (1987-1988) and inducted into Omicron Delta Kappa in 1987. Judge Carson has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1990.

Judge Carson was appointed to the Circuit Court of Virginia's Twenty-Third Judicial Circuit commencing July 1, 2013 and was reappointed for a second eight-year term that commenced July 1, 2021. From 2014 to July, Judge Carson served as presiding judge over the Roanoke Valley Drug Court, which is the first drug court in the Commonwealth of Virginia. Since 2017, Judge Carson has served on the State Drug Court Advisory Committee. He was elected Chief Judge on March 1, 2020 and continues to serve in that position. During his time on the Circuit Court bench, Judge Carson has presided over more than fifty jury trials.

Judge Carson is an active member of the Virginia legal and judicial community. He has been a member of the Judicial Conference of Virginia since 2013 and served on the Executive Committee from 2016 to 2019. He has been a member of the State Drug Treatment Court Advisory Committee since 2017 and, in 2020, he became a member of the Virginia Supreme Court Jury Task Force. Among his many other accomplishments, Judge Carson served on the faculty for the Harry L. Carrico Professionalism Court from 2013 to 2016 and has been a member of the Ted Dalton Inn of Court since 2013.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Judge Carson demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: The Committee finds that Judge Carson possesses the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge Carson's professionalism, demeanor, and depth of knowledge in handling criminal and civil as both a litigator and judge would make him a valuable addition to the Supreme Court of Virginia. Accordingly, the Committee finds that he is well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **RECOMMENDED**.

## THE HONORABLE JOHN CHRISTOPHER CLEMENS

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Christopher Clemens earned his bachelor's degree in Political Science from Roanoke College in 1987 and his Juris Doctor from the T.C. Williams School of Law in December 1990. Judge Clemens has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1991.

After passing the Virginia bar exam, Judge Clemens worked in private practice at Gentry, Locke, Rakes & Moore initially doing civil insurance defense and worker's compensation trial work and then expanding his practice to include criminal defense and domestic relations. His father was a Circuit Court judge when Judge Clemens began practicing law but, when his father retired from the Circuit Court bench, he left Gentry Locke to practice with his father at Guynn & Clemens, P.C., which became Clemens & Clemens, P.C. three years later. From 1995 to 2008, the father and son legal team handled estate planning (his father) and litigation (Judge Clemens). In 2008, Judge Clemens was appointed to the General District Court of Virginia's Twenty-Third Judicial Circuit where he heard cases in Roanoke City, Roanoke County, and the City of Salem. He served on the General District Court for eight years before being elevated to the Circuit Court on July 1, 2016. He continues to serve on the Circuit Court for the Twenty-Third Judicial District as a Presiding Judge.

Judge Clemens is a member of the Virginia Bar Association and the Criminal Law Section. He serves as a substitute instructor for Criminal Law and The Law and Society at Roanoke College, though not a member of the faculty.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Judge Clemens demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: The Committee finds that Judge Clemens possesses the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge Clemens's professionalism, demeanor, and depth of knowledge in handling criminal and civil as both a litigator and judge would make him a valuable addition to the Supreme Court of Virginia. Accordingly, the Committee finds that he is well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **RECOMMENDED**.

## **GREGORY S. DUNCAN**

Experience and Legal Ability: Mr. Duncan earned his bachelor's degree from the Virginia Polytechnic Institute & State University in 1982 and his Juris Doctor from the Washington and Lee School of Law in 1986. Mr. Duncan has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1986.

Mr. Duncan worked in private practice, beginning at Williams, Mullen, Christian and Dobbins, P.C. in 1986. In 1989, Mr. Duncan began his work as a solo practitioner, taking a brief two year break from 1998 to 1999 to work with Payne and Hodous. He returned to his status as a sole practitioner in 1999 and remains as such to this day. Mr. Duncan also served as a Magistrate of the 16<sup>th</sup> Judicial Circuit from 1996 to 1998.

During his legal career, Mr. Duncan has honed his legal practice to focus on the drafting of personal and corporate documents along with other civil litigation matters. Over the last five years, the majority of his practice has been in the federal courts with the remainder divided between the state district and circuit courts. Mr. Duncan is a general practitioner who primarily handles civil litigation and consumer protection cases.

Mr. Duncan is an active outdoorsman who is committed to ensuring that all persons, regardless of ability, have access to the outdoors. For the last five years, he has volunteered with the Wheelin' Sportsmen of Virginia to assist wheelchair bound individuals in outdoor activities. He has also served as a Volunteer Income Tax Assistant to assist low-income individuals with the preparation of their income tax returns. Over the course of his legal career, Mr. Duncan has also provided pro bono legal assistance to various nonprofits during their development and as they need assistance.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Mr. Duncan demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: The Committee finds that Mr. Duncan possesses that requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Mr. Duncan is qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia. He warrants the Committee's rating of **QUALIFIED**.

## THE HONORABLE DOUGLAS L. FLEMING, JR.

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Fleming earned his bachelor's degree from the College of William and Mary in 1979 and his Juris Doctor from the College of William and Mary in 1982. Judge Fleming has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1982.

Judge Fleming worked as an Associate Attorney at Hanes, Sevila, Saunders & McCahill, P.C. from 1982 to 1987, and he was a Partner from 1987 to 1996. He then founded Douglas L. Fleming, Jr., P.C. where he practiced general civil and criminal matters from 1996 to 2015. In 2015, Judge Fleming became a Circuit Court Judge for the 20<sup>th</sup> Judicial Circuit of Virginia. He is currently the Chief Judge of the 20<sup>th</sup> Judicial Circuit.

During his legal career, Judge Fleming has held leadership positions in numerous organizations. He is a former President of the Loudoun County Bar Association. He was also a Director of the Loudoun County Bar Association, where he served two terms. Additionally, he was an adjunct faculty member at Shenandoah University where he taught Business Law in their M.B.A. program.

Judge Fleming is active in his community. He was a youth soccer coach and volunteer with the Loudoun Youth Soccer Association, Premier AC Soccer Club, and former director of the Loudoun Soccer Club. He was also a member of the Loudoun County Economic Development Advisory Committee. Judge Fleming assists individuals with limited means through organizations such as Loudoun County's non-profit holiday toy distribution centers, and he was also a volunteer at the non-profit Blue Ridge Speech and Hearing Center.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Judge Fleming demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity:</u> The Committee finds that Judge Fleming possesses the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge Fleming is well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia. He warrants the Committee's rating of **RECOMMENDED**.

## JENNIFER FRANKLIN

Experience and Legal Ability: Ms. Franklin graduated from Virginia Polytechnic Institute & State University in Blacksburg, Virginia, in 1988. She earned her law degree from Regent University School of Law in 1999. Ms. Franklin became licensed to practice law in the Commonwealth of Virginia in 2000.

Ms. Franklin began her legal career clerking for the Supreme Court of Alabama. She then worked for several years with the Office of the Attorney General for the Commonwealth of Virginia, where her practice focused on criminal appeals and habeas corpus cases. She was the Habeas Supervisor in the Supreme Court of Virginia's Office of the Chief Staff Attorney for approximately eight years, where she advised the Court about habeas issues, managed the disposition of death penalty habeas cases, and reviewed appellate documents and court filings.

Since 2012, Ms. Franklin has worked with law students at William & Mary Law School, teaching appellate advocacy, legal writing, and advanced brief writing, coaching the Moot Court Team, and working with the Appellate Litigation Clinic. She also does *pro bono* work. She has significant substantive experience litigating appeals and addressing appellate work from within the judiciary, as both a former law clerk and as a former staff attorney for the Supreme Court of Virginia. She is accustomed to posing questions to her students in ways that encourage thoughtful responses, and her writing skills are exemplary. Despite her recognized expertise in writing, she is refreshingly delighted by the idea that writing can always be improved and welcomes collaboration for that purpose.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Ms. Franklin has a composed yet welcoming demeanor, evident in both her interview and in discussions with her references. She is described as "the calmest person in the room," and someone who can readily address issues. The Committee believes she demonstrates the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Ms. Franklin is respected among her peers and beloved by her students. Throughout the interview and based upon information gathered, Ms. Franklin demonstrates a level of professionalism and integrity that meets and exceeds the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee believes that Ms. Franklin would bring balance to the Supreme Court of Virginia with her specialized expertise in Habeas Corpus issues, her perspectives from both sides of the bench, and her patience and communication skills developed through her teaching. Her temperament and demeanor are well suited for the Supreme Court of Virginia, and her experience working with others demonstrates that she will be a successful collaborator and consensus builder. The Committee finds that she is well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating as **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

## THE HONORABLE FRANK K. FRIEDMAN

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Friedman attended Harvard College, graduating in 1980 with his undergraduate degree. He earned his law degree from Vanderbilt University School of Law in 1985. Judge Friedman was licensed to practice law in the Commonwealth of Virginia in 1985.

Judge Friedman began his legal career with Woods Rogers, PLC in Roanoke, where he has practiced since 1985. He has cultivated a practice area specialty in appellate work, encompassing a broad range of legal subject matter. Judge Friedman is recognized throughout the Commonwealth for his legal acumen. He has been appointed to several leadership positions within the VBA Appellate Section, the Litigation Section for the Virginia State Bar, the Appellate Practice Subsection for the Virginia State Bar, the Fourth Circuit Rules Advisory Committee, the Board of the Virginia Association of Defense Attorneys, the Supreme Court of Virginia's Appellate Rules Advisory Committee, and the Boyd Graves Conference, in addition to other positions, too numerous to list here. In August 2021, Judge Friedman was appointed to the Court of Appeals of Virginia.

Judge Friedman is a superb appellate writer with a reputation for impeccable judgment. His calm demeanor, kind heart, and mild manner were consistently recognized by his peers and the judges in front of whom he has appeared. He demonstrates a unique depth of knowledge about the appellate process and therefore insight as to improvements that could be made in the appellate courts.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Throughout the interview and from the information gathered, Judge Friedman consistently displays a thoughtful, professional, and respectful demeanor. He recognizes that his skill set is best suited for appellate work where he can thoughtfully consider questions of law and its application, and he recognizes the difficulty facing trial litigators and trial judges in making fast paced arguments and decisions in the moment. The Committee believes Judge Friedman demonstrates the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Judge Friedman is highly respected for his ethical practices, efforts at inclusion, and appellate leadership. Throughout the interview and based upon information gathered, Judge Friedman meets and exceeds the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee believes that Judge Friedman would bring balance to the Supreme Court of Virginia by providing significant civil experience, expertise, and perspective. His temperament and demeanor are exemplary for a thoughtful appellate analysis. The Committee finds that he is well-qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating as **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

## THE HONORABLE RICHARD E. GARDINER

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Gardiner earned his law degree from the International School of Law (now George Mason Antonin Scalia School of Law) in 1978 and was licensed to practice law in Virginia in 1979.

Judge Gardiner worked as Assistant General Counsel for the National Rifle Association of America until 1989, when he transitioned to the role of Director of State and Local Governmental Affairs. From 1991 to 1994, Judge Gardiner worked as Legislative Counsel, and from 1994 to 2013, he worked as a sole practitioner with both a criminal and a civil practice. During this time, he acquired extensive appellate experience. For example, without including the numerous petitions for writs of certiorari he prepared, Judge Gardiner briefed and argued at least 99 appellate cases and briefed eight cases in the United States Supreme Court.

Judge Gardiner is highly respected among his peers and received the Fairfax Bar Association's President's Award and has been recognized by the George Mason University Alumni Association. In 2013, Judge Gardiner was appointed to the Fairfax General District Court and in 2016, he was appointed to the Fairfax Circuit Court, where he currently sits. During his time on the bench Judge Gardiner has authored over 50 written opinions.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through the interview and from the information gathered, Judge Gardiner demonstrates a respect for the judicial process and the role of the court. He enjoys researching and writing thoughtful opinions. Judge Gardiner demonstrates the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Through the interview and information gathered, Judge Gardiner indicated a level of professionalism and integrity sufficient for the Supreme Court of Virginia. Judge Gardiner is regarded as an exceptional attorney and judge among his colleagues.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds Judge Gardiner is very well-qualified for the position on the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating as **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

## MICHAEL V. HERNANDEZ

Experience and Legal Ability: Mr. Hernandez earned his bachelor's degree from the University of Virginia in 1984 and his Juris Doctor from the University of Virginia School of Law in 1987. Mr. Hernandez has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1987.

Mr. Hernandez began his law career in 1987 as a litigation associate at McGuire, Woods, Battle & Boothe in Richmond, Virginia. In 1990, he joined McSweeney, Burtch & Crump, P.C, and in 1992 transitioned to academia, joining the faculty at Regent as an Assistant Professor. During his time at Regent he has progressed from Assistant Professor to tenured Professor in 2001 and served as Dean from 2015 to 2018. He has held several administrative and teaching positions since then.

Mr. Hernandez was recently appointed by the Chief Justice to the Supreme Court of Virginia's Judicial Performance Evaluation Program, Appellate Opinion Review Committee. He has served on the Virginia State Bar Counsel on Legal Education, the Virginia Bar Associate Board of Governors, Membership Committee, and Pro Bono Council, in addition to serving on numerous committees for pro bono service.

During private practice and during his time in academia, Mr. Hernandez has acted as lead and co-counsel in a variety of trial and appellate matters. He is the author of three books and approximately 15 published articles and is a prolific presenter on various legal topics. Mr. Hernandez is very active in his community.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Mr. Hernandez demonstrated his dedication to public service and a commitment to equality in the law. Mr. Hernandez demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Mr. Hernandez demonstrated that he is committed to ensuring that the legal professional maintains professionalism, integrity and civility. The Committee finds that Mr. Hernandez possesses and exceeds the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Mr. Hernandez's litigation and appellate experience, along with his temperament, professionalism, integrity and commitment to public service, access to justice and equality in the law, make him a good candidate for the Supreme Court of Virginia. The Committee finds that Mr. Hernandez is qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **RECOMMENDED**.

## THE HONORABLE GLEN A. HUFF

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Huff earned his bachelor's degree from the University of Maine in 1973 and his Juris Doctor from the Franklin Pierce Law Center, now the University of New Hampshire School of Law, in 1976. Mr. Candidate has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1976.

Judge Huff began his law career as a law clerk to Chief Judge Richard B. Kellam in the U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of Virginia. Following his clerkship, he founded and grew the firm that ultimately became Huff, Poole and Mahoney, PC in Virginia Beach. In 2011, he was elected to the Court of Appeals of Virginia, where he currently sits, and served as Chief Judge from 2014 to 2018. Judge Huff has authored over 200 opinions while sitting on the Court of Appeals.

During his legal career, Judge Huff received numerous honors from various organizations and publications, including an AV Rating by Martindale-Hubble, and was included in Best Lawyers in America, Virginia Legal Elite, and Super Lawyers. Judge Huff is a founding member and past president of the James Kent American Inn of Court, served as the president of the Virginia Beach Bar Association and the Federal Bar Association, and served on the Board of Governors for the Family Law Section of the Virginia State Bar. Judge Huff has served as a faculty member for the Harry L. Carrico Professionalism Course and continuing legal education courses, lectured at the Solo and Small Practice seminar of the Virginia State Bar, was an adjunct professor at William & Mary School of Law and is a current adjunct at Regent University School of Law.

Judge Huff is also active in his community, having served on various boards including as the President of the Central Business District Association, the Virginia Beach Forum and the Cape Henry Rotary Club. He is currently the President of the Samaritan House which is focused on assisting victims of domestic violence and human trafficking. He enjoys boating, woodworking, writing and music.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Judge Huff demonstrated his dedication to public service and a commitment to equality in the law. Judge Huff demonstrated that he possesses and exceeds the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Judge Huff demonstrates that he "walks the walk and talks the talk" and is committed to ensuring that the legal professional maintains professionalism, integrity and civility. The Committee finds that Judge Huff possesses and exceeds the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge Huff's significant and broad litigation and appellate experience, along with his fairness, temperament, professionalism, integrity and commitment to public service, access to justice, and equality in the law, make him an excellent candidate for the Supreme Court of Virginia. The Committee finds that Judge Huff is very well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of HIGHLY RECOMMENDED.

#### THE HONORABLE DAVID W. LANNETTI

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Lannetti graduated from the United States Naval Academy in 1981 and earned his master's degree from Troy State University in 1994. He served as Lieutenant Commander in the U.S. Navy from 1981 to 1996. Judge Lannetti earned his Juris Doctor from the College of William and Mary in 1999 and was admitted to the Virginia State Bar that year.

Judge Lannetti began his legal career at Vandeventer Black, LLP in Norfolk, and became a partner in 2007. His practice focused on creditors' rights, bankruptcy, construction law, commercial litigation, maritime law, and alternative dispute resolution. He was also a certified Criminal Justice Act (CJA) attorney, where he accepted court-appointed federal felony criminal cases. He served as Commissioner in Chancery for the Norfolk Circuit Court from 2007 to 2014, presiding over partition actions, equitable distribution actions, real estate sales, and debtor's interrogatories.

In 2010, Judge Lannetti was appointed as a Substitute Judge for Virginia District Courts, where he presided over primarily civil cases, misdemeanor criminal cases, and felony probable cause hearings. In 2014, he was appointed to the Norfolk Circuit Court bench, where he continues to preside over a variety of civil and criminal cases and oversees the Judicial Internship Program.

Judge Lannetti serves as an adjunct professor at William & Mary Law School and Regent University Law School and is a faculty member of the Virginia CLE National Trial Advocacy College and the Virginia CLE Legal Writing Workshop. He has authored or co-authored over 40 legal articles, in addition to hundreds of judicial opinions, and several in-depth law review articles.

Judge Lannetti has demonstrated his dedication to advancing the practice of law in his service on numerous committees, including the Executive Committee and the Rules Committee of the Virginia Supreme Court; Chair, Virginia State Bar Standing Committee on Professionalism and Harry L. Carrico Professionalism Course Faculty; Board of Governors, Section on the Education of Lawyers; Board of Governors, Section on Construction Law & Public Contracts; Virginia Bar Association *Pro Bono* Council; Boyd-Graves Conference; Norfolk & Portsmouth Bar Association, Founder and Co-Chair, Bench-Bar Relations Committee; and the James Kent American Inn of Court, Executive Committee.

Judge Lannetti participates and has held leadership roles in many community organizations, such as the Boy Scouts of America; the Girl Scouts of America; Larchmont United Methodist Church; Norfolk Emergency Shelter Team; Norfolk & Portsmouth Bar Association Foundation; Norfolk Sister City Association; U.S. Naval Academy "Blue & Gold"; Special Olympics Virginia; and the YMCA.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Throughout the interview and application process it was evident that Judge Lannetti demonstrates the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Judge Lannetti meets and exceeds the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge Lannetti's knowledge, skills, and experience gained throughout his career as an attorney and Circuit Court judge would make him a valuable addition to the Supreme Court of Virginia. The Committee finds he is well-qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating as **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

# **ROBERT W. LOFTIN**

Experience and Legal Ability: Mr. Loftin earned his bachelor's degree from the University of Virginia in 1995 and his Juris Doctor from the University of Richmond School of Law in 2004. Mr. Loftin has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 2004.

Mr. Loftin is an appellate advocate and trial lawyer, who serves as Counsel at McGuireWoods in Richmond. Before joining McGuireWoods in 201, he was an associate on the Competition Team at Hunton & Williams from 2006 to 2011, and prior to that served as a law clerk to the Honorable Donald W. Lemons of the Supreme Court of Virginia from 2004 to 2006.

During his legal career, Mr. Loftin has argued and briefed a multitude of cases before the Supreme Court of Virginia, and also has experience in cases that have come before the Supreme Court of the United States, Third, Fourth and Federal Circuits.

Mr. Loftin is a member of the Boyd-Graves Conference, the Supreme Court of Virginia's Court of Appeals Expanded Jurisdiction Rules Committee, and the Virginia Bar Associate Appellate Section. He previously served on the Appellate Rules Advisory Committee for the Supreme Court of Virginia and was the Chair and Vice Chair of the Antitrust Law Section of the Virginia State Bar.

Mr. Loftin has served as a substitute judge in the Commonwealth since 2012, regularly presents CLEs on Virginia appellate and civil litigation matters and has authored several articles. He has been included in Virginia Business' Virginia's Legal Elite in the field of Appellate Law since 2017. He was previously named a Super Lawyer and a Virginia Rising Star in Appellate, Antitrust and Business Litigation. And notably, he was awarded the E. Randolph Williams Award three times (2008-2010) for Outstanding Pro Bono Service.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Mr. Loftin demonstrated his dedication to public service and a commitment to equality in the law. Mr. Loftin demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Mr. Loftin demonstrated that he is committed to ensuring that the legal professional maintains professionalism, integrity and civility. The Committee finds that Mr. Loftin possesses the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that due to Mr. Loftin's litigation and appellate experience, along with his temperament, professionalism, integrity and commitment to public service, the Committee finds that Mr. Loftin is well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **RECOMMENDED**.

## K. LORRAINE LORD

Experience and Legal Ability: K. Lorraine Lord earned her bachelor's and Juris Doctor degrees from Washington and Lee in 1990 and 1996, respectively. She has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1996. She is admitted to practice in all courts of the Commonwealth and the Supreme Court of the United States, the U.S. District Court for the Eastern and Western Districts of Virginia, and the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Fourth Circuit.

Ms. Lord has extensive appellate experience. From 1997 to 1998 she clerked for Justice A. Christian Compton of the Supreme Court of Virginia. She then did appellate work and complex litigation at Troutman Sanders LLP from 1998 to 2001, and then at McGuire Woods LLP from 2005 to 2104. At McGuire Woods, she built and supervised a team of attorneys that handled criminal appeals to the Supreme Court of Virginia on a pro bono basis.

In 2014, Ms. Lord became the first woman to serve as Chief Staff Attorney to the Supreme Court of Virginia. In her position, she leads an office of attorneys in reviewing the majority of petitions for appeal and original jurisdiction matters filed for consideration by the Supreme Court of Virginia. She and her office prepare analytical memoranda in a wide range of civil, criminal and administrative agency appeal matters, including zoning appeals, wills and trusts, tax, mandamus, habeas, sovereign immunity, juror bias, search and seizure, interrogations, motions for mistrial and others. She also assists the Chief Justice on committees and working groups, to include the Court of Appeals Expanded Jurisdiction Rules Committee, the Study Group on Court of Appeals Jurisdiction and Senate Joint Resolution 47 and the Supreme Court of Virginia Lawyer Well-Being Committee.

In addition, Ms. Lord has presented at continuing legal education seminars on appellate practice, has participated with panels regarding appeals and the Virginia Court of Appeals, is a presenter at the Supreme Court of Virginia's annual training of new judicial staff, and is a lecturer at Washington and Lee University School of Law on Higher Education Law.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through her submission and interview, Ms. Lord demonstrated that she possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia. Her references complimented her excellent level of professionalism, her civility, courtesy, and a nature that engenders trust in the legal process.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: The Committee finds that Ms. Lord possesses the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Ms. Lord and is very well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

## THE HONORABLE MARY MALVEAUX

Experience and Legal Ability: The Honorable Mary Malveaux earned her bachelor's degree from the University of Virginia in 1990 and her Juris Doctor from University of Richmond, T.C. Williams School of Law in 1993. Judge Malveaux has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1993.

Judge Malveaux began her legal career as an Associate Attorney at El-Amin & Crawford in 1993, practicing civil litigation and criminal defense. She then worked as an Assistant Commonwealth's Attorney serving Henrico County beginning in 1994. In 1998 Judge Malveaux joined Brenner, Evans & Millman (now Freeborn & Peters, LLP), where her practice included insurance defense, general civil litigation, and criminal defense.

Judge Malveaux was appointed to the General District Court of Henrico County in 2011 and was elevated to the Virginia Court of Appeals in 2016. During her time on the bench, Judge Malveaux has authored approximately 120 opinions.

Judge Malveaux is active in the legal community, serving on the Supreme Court's Wellness Advisory Committee (2020 – present); the Advisory Committee on the Rules of Court (2014 – 2016; 2020 – present); the Judicial Performance Evaluation Advisory Committee (2020 – present); and the Criminal Justice Service Board (2014 – present).

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through her submission and interview, Judge Malveaux demonstrated that she possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: The Committee finds that Judge Malveaux possesses the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge Malveaux's depth of knowledge in handling criminal, civil, and agency matters (among others) as both a litigator and judge would make her a valuable addition to the Supreme Court of Virginia. Accordingly, the Committee finds that she is well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

## THE HONORABLE THOMAS MANN

Experience and Legal Ability: The Honorable Thomas Mann earned his bachelor's degree from New York University in 1987 and his Juris Doctor from American University, Washington College of Law in 1990. Judge Mann has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1990.

Judge Mann began his legal career at the law firm of Greenspun & Mann, P.C. (Klein & Greenspun, P.C.) in 1990 and later became Partner. In 1995 Judge Mann worked for Deckelbaum, Ogens and Fischer in Washington, D.C. and returned to Greenspun & Mann, P.C. (Peter D. Greenspun & Associates, P.C.) in 1997. In 2000 Judge Mann became a Substitute Judge serving the Juvenile & Domestic Relations and General District Courts in Fairfax, Arlington, Loudoun, and Alexandria. In 2006, Judge Mann was appointed as a Judge in Fairfax County Juvenile and Domestic Relations District Court, where he was Chief Judge from 2010 to 2012. In 2016, Judge Mann was elevated to the Circuit Court of Fairfax County.

Judge Mann regularly serves as a judicial panelist and program materials author at Virginia CLEs, such as Fairfax Bar Association, Criminal Law Section CLE: "Protective Orders and Violations" (2019), Capacity: A Guardian Ad Litem Professionalism CLE: "A View from the Bench" (2019), and 17th Annual Law & Technology CLE: "Ethical Misadventures in the Courtroom" (2019). In addition, Judge Mann organized and facilitated "AYUDA" a multi-circuit judicial training presentation addressing federal immigration issues (2020). He also organized a multi-circuit judicial training on new probation guidelines law and procedure for the Virginia Sentencing Commission (2021).

Judge Mann is also active in his community, serving as a member of the Fairfax County Domestic Violence Prevention Policy Coordinating Counsel. He is Vice President of the McLean Place Townhome Condominium Board of Directors. In addition, Judge Mann is on the Executive Board of Fairfax County Court Technology. He also participates in Fairfax County Public Schools Ethics Day and is an annual panelist for Stop the Violence Training through LSNV.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Judge Mann demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: The Committee finds that Judge Mann possesses the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge Mann is well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia. He warrants the Committee's rating of **RECOMMENDED**.

## THE HONORABLE STACEY W. MOREAU

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Moreau earned her law degree from the T.C. Williams School of Law at the University of Richmond in 1990. She was licensed to practice law in Virginia that same year. While in law school, she clerked for the United States Attorney's Office in the Western District of Virginia and interned at the Henrico Country Commonwealth Attorney's Office.

Judge Moreau began her legal career at the firm of Williams, Stilwell, and Morrison in Danville, Virginia in 1990 and became a partner at the firm in 1994. Judge Moreau's private practice involved domestic relations, civil litigation, personal injury, and criminal work, including serving on the Indigent Defender Board of Calcasieu Parrish as a private attorney when the Public Defender had a conflict with a case.

In 2003, Judge Moreau was appointed to the Juvenile & Domestic Relations District Court for the Twenty-Second Judicial District, which encompasses the City of Danville, Franklin County, and Pittsylvania County. In 2012, she was elevated to the Circuit Court bench for the same district.

Judge Moreau is serving a four-year term on the Judicial Council of Virginia; on the Circuit Court Judge Benchbook Committee, where she authored the DUI section of the benchbook; Circuit Court Caseload Statistical Reporting Project; Judicial Imaging System Advisory Committee and SWIFT Interface for Judges and Clerks focus group; and serving as a mentor judge for the Judicial Mentoring Program. She is a member of the Virginia Association of Women Judges and works to expand the use of technology in the court, converting her court to a paperless system. Judge Moreau is also heavily involved in her community, serving on the Mount Cross Volunteer Fire Department Board of Directors and being a member of Chatham Rotary Club, among many others.

<u>Fairness and Temperament:</u> Through the interview and from the information gathered, Judge Moreau demonstrates a respect for the judicial process and the role of the court. She values diversity on the bench and in the legal profession. Judge Moreau strongly believes in the need for fairness to litigants in the court system and professionalism of counsel appearing before her. Judge Moreau demonstrates the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity:</u> Through the interview and information gathered, Judge Moreau demonstrated a level of professionalism and integrity that exceeds the requisite for the Supreme Court of Virginia. Her professionalism and integrity are reflected in her selection as one of the Top 50 Influential Women of Virginia in 2015.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds Judge Moreau very well-qualified for the position on the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating as **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED.** 

## THE HONORABLE STUART A. RAPHAEL

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Raphael earned his law degree from the University of Virginia in 1989 and was licensed to practice law the same year. Judge Raphael began his career in law with Hunton & Williams LLP and focused his practice on appellate litigation, constitutional law, state and local government law, complex litigation, toxic torts, construction litigation, and water rights. He was made partner at the firm in 1997. In 2014, Judge Raphael was appointed Solicitor General of Virginia. He was in this position until 2017, when he returned to Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP. Judge Raphael has a great deal of appellate experience arguing cases to the Supreme Court of the United States, the 4<sup>th</sup> Circuit, and the Supreme Court of Virginia. The subject matter of the cases he has undertaken on appeal is as varied as his areas of practice. Most notably, he argued and won *Virginia v. Maryland* (Virginia has the right to use the Potomac River without MD's permission) *and Bostic v. Rainey* (same sex marriage ban violates 14<sup>th</sup> amendment). In 2021, Judge Raphael was appointed to the Court of Appeals of Virginia.

Judge Raphael is a self-described appellate nerd who enjoys reading and researching the law and understanding the history of law. He also has a strong commitment to public service and for this reason, among others, seeks appointment to the Supreme Court of Virginia. Judge Raphael has considered judgment, significant experience with the interplay of state and appellate courts, and experience in a wide variety of practice areas. He is described by his peers as having "encyclopedic knowledge of Virginia law and procedure." Judge Raphael has received many awards and recognition of his accomplishments, including being a Fellow with the American Academy of Appellate Lawyers, Best Brief in the U. S. Supreme Court for his *amicus* brief in *Obergefell v. Hodges*, Leading Individual in Commercial Litigation, national leader in water rights, and named "Legal Elite" in Richmond Business for Appellate Law.

Judge Raphael demonstrates a sincere desire to make a difference for the Commonwealth of Virginia and its residents, and also understands his judicial role if appointed to the Supreme Court of Virginia. He seeks this appointment to continue to make a difference by promoting Virginia's tradition of justice and respect for the rule of law, while serving his community.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through the interview and from the information gathered, Judge Raphael demonstrates a respect for the judicial process and the role of the court. Judge Raphael demonstrates the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Throughout the interview and based upon information gathered, Judge Raphael demonstrated a level of professionalism and integrity that meets and exceeds that required for the Supreme Court of Virginia. That professionalism extends to his sense of responsibility to all litigants, including those of diverse cultural and economic backgrounds.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds Judge Raphael is very well-qualified for the position on the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating as **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

# PATRICIA P. RENE (nee NAGEL)

Experience and Legal Ability: Ms. Rene earned her law degree from the University of San Francisco School of Law in 1990 and was admitted to practice law in Virginia in 1995.

Ms. Rene has worked in private practice in Williamsburg in the area of criminal defense and also maintains a busy appellate practice and both state and federal court. As part of her appellate practice, Ms. Rene has filed hundreds of appeals in state and federal courts, and writs in the United States Supreme Court, originating from state and federal appellate courts. Ms. Rene has been granted 66 writs of appeal in Virginia appellate courts and has substantial oral argument experience. She has also served as a member of the United States Criminal Justice Act panel since 2010, representing indigent defendants in federal court and on state court-appointed lists, representing indigent clients at both the trial and appellate levels. She has employed technical experts in her cases and is well-versed with subjects such as computer forensics. She has also served as a Guardian *ad litem* in family law cases.

Prior to her robust private practice, Ms. Rene also served for five years as an appellate attorney with the Office of the Public Defender for the City of Richmond and for two years with the Virginia Indigent Defense Commission. She developed training programs for new attorneys to handle appeals and presented at numerous CLE's on appellate practice. She remains a resource to attorneys across Virginia seeking assistance with their trial and appellate practice.

Ms. Rene evinces fairness, judgment and commitment to her clients. She is experienced in both trial and appellate court matters, and in the interplay of state and federal courts. Ms. Rene is committed to serving indigent clients and increasing access to courts for those who have traditionally been excluded or faced difficulties in accessing the courts. The committee believes she would bring a needed defense-oriented perspective to the bench providing intellectual diversity to the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Fairness and Temperament:</u> During the interview and from the information gathered, Ms. Rene demonstrated respect for the judicial process and the role of the court. She is committed to providing her clients their opportunity before the courts and advocating their position. She understands how the law can affect individuals on a personal level and has expressed her thoughts on how to increase representation for indigent clients. Ms. Rene demonstrates and exceeds the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity:</u> Through the interview and information gathered, Ms. Rene demonstrates a level of professionalism and integrity that meets and exceeds the requisite professionalism and integrity required for the Supreme Court of Virginia. That professionalism extends to her sense of commitment to all litigants, including indigent and minority clients.

Overall Evaluation: The committee finds Ms. Rene is very well-qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the committee's rating as **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

## THE HONORABLE WESLEY G. RUSSELL, JR.

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Russell earned his bachelor's degree from the University of Virginia in 1992 and his Juris Doctor from the George Mason University School of Law in 1995. Judge Russell has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1995.

Judge Russell began his law career as a law clerk to the Circuit Court of the City of Richmond, which then included Chief Justice Donald W. Lemons. From 1996 to 2006 he worked in private practice as a litigator. In 2006, he joined the Office of the Attorney General as a Deputy Attorney General and head of the Civil Litigation Division. Upon leaving the Attorney General's office in 2014, Judge Russell joined Blank & Sorkin, P.C. as a principal, until his appointment to the Court of Appeals in 2015, where he remains to date.

Before joining the Court of Appeals bench, Judge Russell argued 14 merits arguments before the Supreme Court of Virginia, the Virginia Court of Appeals, and the United States Court of Appeals for the 4<sup>th</sup> Circuit. During his tenure on the bench, he has heard over 500 appellate cases.

Judge Russell has served on the Advisory Committee on Rules for the Supreme Court of Virginia, the Chief Justice's Ad Hoc Committee on Redrafting Appellate Rules, and the Special Committee to Study Appellate Mediation in Virginia.

Judge Russell has had scholarly articles published in three law reviews since 2008. His current bar organization service includes the Virginia Bar Association, Civil Litigation Council (2016-present); the Family Law Section of the Virginia State Bar, Board of Governors (2015-present); the Education of Lawyers Section of the Virginia State Bar, Board of Governors (2020-present); and the Bar Association of the City of Richmond (1996-present).

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Judge Russell demonstrated his dedication to public service and a commitment to equality in the law. Judge Russell demonstrated that he possesses and exceeds the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Judge Russell demonstrated a sincere commitment to ensuring that the legal professional maintains professionalism, integrity and civility. The Committee finds that Judge Russell possesses and exceeds the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge Russell's significant and broad litigation and appellate experience, along with his fairness, temperament, professionalism, integrity and commitment to public service, access to justice, and equality in the law, make him an excellent candidate for the Supreme Court of Virginia. The Committee finds that Judge Russell is very well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating of **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED.** 

## WALTER G. SHARP, SR.

Experience and Legal Ability: Mr. Sharp earned his bachelor's degree from the United States Naval Academy in 1978; his Juris Doctor from Texas Tech University School of Law in 1984; his LL.M. in International and Comparative Law from Georgetown University Law Center in 1988; his LL.M. in Military Law from the U.S. Army Judge Advocate General's School of Law in 1992; and his S.J.D. in International Law from the University of Virginia School of Law in 2005. He has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1998.

Mr. Sharp began his legal career with the U.S. Marine Corps as a Judge Advocate and later transitioned to the U.S. Department of Defense as a civilian attorney. Mr. Sharp retired from the Department of Defense and the practice of law in 2017. Mr. Sharp is still a member of the Virginia State Bar and licensed to practice. In his retirement, Mr. Sharp volunteers and serves as a certified police officer with the Harrisonburg Police Department; teaches National Security Law & Policy as an adjunct Professor at James Madison University; and volunteers with the U.S. Naval Academy Blue & Gold Officer Program.

While Mr. Sharp had a very interesting and distinguished career handling various and very complex issues of national security, intelligence oversight, cyber security/warfare and other areas of federal and international law, his experience with Virginia law and procedure is lacking. Mr. Sharp acknowledged that he has not practiced in Virginia courts, has no experience with appellate law and procedure in Virginia, and would start his preparation, if appointed for this vacancy, by familiarizing himself with the rules of the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through his submission and interview, Mr. Sharp demonstrated that he possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: The Committee finds that Mr. Sharp possesses the requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Mr. Sharp lacks the requisite knowledge and experience with Virginia law and Virginia courts for the Supreme Court of Virginia. The Committee finds that he warrants the Committee's rating of **NOT QUALIFIED**.

# THE HONORABLE KIMBERLY WHITE

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge White earned her bachelor's degree from Mary Washington College (now the University of Mary Washington) in 1985 and her Juris Doctor from Mercer University in 1988. Judge White has been a member of the Virginia State Bar since 1988.

Judge White began her legal career in private practice with Vaughan & Slayton in 1988. During this time, she also worked as a part-time Assistant Public Defender. In 1991, she pivoted to prosecution, joining the Office of the Commonwealth's Attorney for the City of Lynchburg. In 1995, she was promoted to the position of Deputy Commonwealth's Attorney and simultaneously served as a Special Assistant United States Attorney for the Western District of Virginia. In 1997, she returned to private practice with Woods Rogers, PLC, and was later elevated to Principal in 2000. In 2004, she ran for and won the elected position of Commonwealth's Attorney for Halifax County, where she remained until being appointed as a Circuit Court Judge in 2012. She currently serves as the Chief Judge of the Circuit Court for the Tenth Judicial Circuit of Virginia.

During her legal career, Judge White has held leadership positions in numerous organizations. She has served on the Virginia State Bar Council; as the former Vice President and Treasurer of the Commonwealth's Attorneys' Services Council; and as Past Chair of the Criminal Law Section of the Virginia State Bar. Judge White has been recognized as a Fellow of the Virginia Law Foundation in 2010, and as a 2011 "Influential Women of Virginia" by Virginia Lawyers Media. Judge White was also recognized by the Virginia State Bar in 2012 by a resolution honoring her service to the bar. She remains committed to serving the legal community and believes in the importance of mentoring younger attorneys.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through her submission and interview, Judge White demonstrated that she possesses the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity:</u> The Committee finds that Judge White possesses that requisite professionalism and integrity for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds that Judge White is very well qualified for the Supreme Court of Virginia. She warrants the Committee's rating of **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

## THE HONORABLE VICTORIA A. B. WILLIS

Experience and Legal Ability: Judge Willis earned her law degree from T.C. Williams School of Law in 1986 and was licensed to practice law the same year. She began her legal career as a clerk for the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court of Virginia, Harry L. Carrico, from 1986 to 1988.

After her clerkship, Judge Willis worked in private practice in Fredericksburg and Richmond where she gained experience handling civil litigation, corporate matters (transactional and governance), criminal litigation, state and federal compliance matters, employment cases, healthcare cases and finance matters. Later, she worked in-house for a health system, rising to General Counsel and Vice President before returning to private practice in 2001. She has handled temporary detention orders as special counsel at Spotsylvania Regional Medical Center. In 2014, she was appointed as a Circuit Court Judge for the Fifteenth Judicial Circuit, where she currently sits. Judge Willis has served as faculty for the Harry L. Carrico Professionalism Course, at the University of Mary Washington and at the University of Auburn. She also conducts judicial training for new judges on how to preside over jury trials. Judge Willis has contributed to multiple publications and has written numerous opinions while on the bench. Since her appointment to the bench, she has embraced a leadership role, while also maintaining her previous workload.

Judge Willis has considered judgment, experience with the interplay of state and appellate courts, and experience in a wide variety of practice areas that would be beneficial to her and the Court if she is appointed to the Supreme Court of Virginia. She would bring to the Supreme Court of Virginia not only diversity based on gender, but also diversity of perspective. Judge Willis presides over both civil and criminal dockets and is the only judge in her circuit that handles the probate docket. She seeks to ensure each litigant, win or lose, leaves the courthouse feeling heard. Judge Willis is very active in her community. Prior to being appointed to the bench, she volunteered her time and legal services to assist with establishing the Children's Community Theater and assisted in setting up Lloyd Moss Free Clinic to provide health services to the working uninsured. She has also provided her time and legal expertise to members of the community needing guidance regarding elder law issues.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Through the interview and from the information gathered, Judge Willis demonstrates a respect for the judicial process and the role of the court. While she makes her decisions based on the law and evidence before her, Judge Willis seeks to ensure each litigant knows that she heard and understood their argument/position. Judge Willis demonstrates the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Through the interview and information gathered, Judge Willis indicated a level of professionalism and integrity sufficient for the Supreme Court of Virginia. That professionalism extends to her sense of responsibility to all litigants, including those of diverse cultural backgrounds.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee finds Judge Willis is very well-qualified for the position on the Supreme Court of Virginia and warrants the Committee's rating as **HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**.

#### **CATHERINE FRENCH ZAGURSKIE**

Experience and Legal Ability: Ms. Zagurskie attended Smith College, graduating magna cum laude in 2002. She later earned her law degree, summa cum laude, from Case Western University in 2006, and an M.S. in Social Administration with a concentration in Mental Health.

Ms. Zagurskie began her legal career in 2006 with the Office of the Capital Defender in Richmond where she litigated capital offenses and used her social work background to craft mitigation arguments. She transitioned to the Office of the Public Defender for Richmond City in 2007 where she served as an assistant public defender and trial attorney before ultimately focusing her practice on appellate work. Ms. Zagurskie has worked for the Virginia Indigent Defense Commission since 2012, currently serving as its Chief Appellate Counsel. In addition to managing her own appellate caseload, she oversees 25 appellate supervisors and serves as the Commonwealth's resident appellate expert as the first line of support to 300 public defenders and 1,500 certified court-appointed counsel. She is also an executive member of the VIDC Legislative Team and advocates for mental health and substance abuse reforms.

Ms. Zagurskie has presented at over 30 CLEs to educate the Virginia Bar on criminal and appellate issues. In 2016, she was enlisted by the University of Richmond School of Law to consult on their criminal law curriculum, leading to the development and launch of the Criminal Law and Psychiatry course, which she current instructs as an Adjunct Professor.

Ms. Zagurskie is well recognized throughout the Commonwealth for her knowledge and has been appointed to several advisory committees. In 2013, Ms. Zagurskie was invited by now Justice Stephen McCullough to serve on the Boyd Graves Evidence Committee. In 2015, she teamed with Chief Judge Marla Graff Decker to develop and lead appellate training programs which continue today. She has been twice solicited by the Governor, first for the Governor's Center for Behavioral Health and Justice Advisory Group, then as a member of the Governor's Advisory Commission on Opioids and Addiction. She also serves on the Supreme Court of Virginia's Behavioral Health Docket Advisory Committee.

<u>Fairness and Temperament</u>: Throughout the interview and from the information gathered, Ms. Zagurskie consistently displays a thoughtful, professional, and respectful demeanor. The Committee believes she demonstrates the requisite fairness and temperament for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

<u>Professionalism and Integrity</u>: Ms. Zagurskie is highly respected among her superiors and peers for her ethical practices and appellate leadership. Throughout the interview and based upon information gathered, Ms. Zagurskie demonstrates a level of professionalism and integrity that meets and exceeds the needs for the Supreme Court of Virginia.

Overall Evaluation: The Committee believes that Ms. Zagurskie would bring balance to the Supreme Court of Virginia by providing significant criminal defense experience and perspective. The Committee further believes that with additional experience outside of criminal law, Ms. Zagurskie would be an exceptional addition to the appellate courts. The Committee finds that she is well qualified for the position of a Supreme Court of Virginia Judge and warrants the Committee's rating as **RECOMMENDED**.